

At Edinburgh and within Davidson's Mains Parish Church, the seventh day of March 2009, the Presbytery of Edinburgh met and was constituted with prayer.

Sederunt

The Reverend W P Graham, Moderator, the Reverend Dr G J Whyte, Clerk, and others, Ministers, Deacons and Elders as in the Register of Attendance.

1. PRESENTATION

Prof. Callum Brown addressed the Presbytery and raised many interesting ideas and statistics. His talk was titled " Church, Community and Culture, aspects of Scotland in the last 50 years. At the end of his address there was a question and answer session.

2. CONFERENCE SESSION

The Presbytery divided into ten groups, each group considered the questions " How would you describe a healthy congregation?"

When the Presbytery resumed in plenary session, the Rev Peter Graham expressed the thanks of the Presbytery to the Prof Callum Brown for his presentation and to the minister and Kirk session of Davidson's Mains Parish church for their welcome and the use of their premises and facilities.

Appendix 1

3. ROLL OF PRESBYTERY

3.1. Death of Member

The moderator intimated that the Reverend Richard A Baigrie, retired minister had died on 11 February 2009 and that a tribute would be paid to him at the April meeting.

3.2. Welcome

The Moderator expressed a welcome to the Reverend Dr Alistair Donald who was recently introduced as Chaplain at Heriot Watt University.

4. MINUTES

The minutes of the meetings held on 3 February 2009 and 26 February 2009 were submitted and approved.

5. ORDER OF BUSINESS

The Order of Business as circulated was submitted, amended and approved.

6. CONGREGATIONAL BUSINESS: CRAIGMILLAR PARK

There was laid on the table a Call, sustained by the Vacancy Procedure Committee of the Presbytery of Argyll, addressed to the Reverend Sarah Nicol, Minister of Craigmillar Park from the congregations of Kirn in deferred linking with Dunoon: St John's with Sandbank.

It was moved, seconded and agreed;

The Presbytery:

6.1 agree to translate Mrs Nicol.

6.2 declare that she will remain Minister of Craigmillar Park until her admission to Kirn on 18th April 2009.

6.3 appoint the Reverend John McPake minister of Liberton Northfield as Interim Moderator in the forthcoming vacancy at Craigmillar Park;

6.4 remit to the Deployment of Resources Committee the vacancy pending at Craigmillar Park for consideration and report;

6.5 authorise the Clerk to intimate these decisions to the congregation of Craigmillar Park.

6.6 authorise the Clerk to send an extract minute of these proceedings to the Presbytery of Argyll.

The Presbytery agreeing the translation of Reverend Sarah Nicol from the charge of Craigmillar Park to Kirn, Mrs Pauline Weibye spoke on behalf of the Congregation.

The Moderator expressed the thanks of the Presbytery to Sarah Nicol for her ministry in Edinburgh and assured her of their good wishes in her new appointment.

Mrs Nicol made suitable reply.

7. VACANCY BUSINESS

CALL FROM KIRKLISTON

7.1. There were laid on the table an appointment to the church and parish of Edinburgh: Kirkliston in favour of Mrs Margaret R Lane, Graduate Candidate, with the relative Schedules, and a Call as prescribed signed by 173 members and 20 regular worshippers, together with letter of acceptance with the required statement that she had used no undue influence to secure the Call.

7.2. The Presbytery, being satisfied with the documents produced, and that there is no cause to decline or delay the appointment, did, and hereby do, sustain the appointment and Call of Mrs Lane to the church and parish of Kirkliston and resolve to proceed towards her settlement.

7.3. The Presbytery appointed to meet for the Ordination and Induction of Mrs Margaret Lane to the church and parish of Edinburgh: Kirkliston on 16 April 2009 at 6.45 pm for Service at 7.00 pm. The Presbytery appointed the Reverend Sean Swindells to conduct the devotions, the Reverend Russell Moffat to preach the sermon and the Moderator to preside, ordain, induct, and address the minister and congregation.

7.4. The Presbytery instructed that the prescribed edict be served in Kirkliston on Sundays 5 April and 12 April 2009.

8. BUSINESS COMMITTEE

The Convener, Dr Derek Browning, gave in the Report.

It was moved, seconded and agreed:

The Presbytery:

- 8.1. appoint the Very Reverend Dr Gilleasbuig Macmillan as Interim Moderator at Leith North from 4 March 2009.
- 8.2. issue a Practising Certificate to the Reverend Dr Kenneth Baird on his demission from Leith North on 3 March 2009.
- 8.3. grant permission to the Kirk Sessions of St John's Oxfangs and Leith North to hold the congregation's Stated Annual Meeting after 31st March 2009.
- 8.4. agree to the appointment of the Reverend Jim Wilkie as Interim Moderator at Stockbridge for the period 6th July to 24th August 2009 while the Reverend Dr Anne T Logan is on study leave.

9. DEPLOYMENT OF RESOURCES

The Vice Convener, Mr Alexander Gemmill, gave in the Report.

It was moved, seconded and agreed:

The Presbytery:

9.1 Approve Basis of Linking: Kaimes Lockhart Memorial with Liberton

The congregation of Kaimes Lockhart Memorial and the congregation of Liberton shall be linked as from a date to be determined by the Presbytery of Edinburgh, and that on the following terms and conditions:

Appendix 2 for Report

9.2 approve the appointment of the Rev. W Peter Graham as an Associate Minister at Greenbank Parish Church on a part time basis of 8 to 10 hours per week. This locally funded appointment is for 18 months in the first instance.

10. SUPERINTENDENCE

The Convener, Mr Charles Godon, gave in the report.

It was taken as read, moved, seconded and agreed:

The Presbytery:

10.1 commend the report for raising awareness of Congregational Conflict and outlining something of what is being done to reduce the likelihood of conflict and deal more effectively with conflict when it occurs.

10.2 having considered its own practices, is not aware of any specifics that require immediate attention. However, conflict recognition, conflict avoidance and conflict resolution will be considered as part of a Presbytery Review of Reviewing presently under way.

10.3 welcome the 'Code of Professional Practice and Conduct for the Ministries of the Church of Scotland' but regrets its lack of Christian perspectives.

10.4 acknowledge the valued work of the Ministry Support Officers and the skills of Interim Ministers and would encourage greater access to conciliation and mediation training for those involved in pastoral support and supervision at Presbytery level.

See Appendix 3 for Report.

11. RECORDS

The Convener, Mr Norman Jamieson, gave in the Report

It was taken as read, moved, seconded and agreed:

The Presbytery

11.1 note that the Records Committee has examined the Minute Book of Presbytery from 4th December 2007 to 4th November 2008 (pages 192 – 199 and pages 1 – 103 inclusive) and has found them to be in very good order.

11.2 report accordingly to the Legal Questions Committee.

12 CONGREGATIONAL FINANCE

The Convener, Mr Brian Moar, gave in the Report

It was taken as read, moved, seconded and agreed:

The Presbytery

grant the request of the congregation of Leith, St Thomas Junction Road Church that they use methods of payment other than monthly standing order to pay their full contributions to central funds from the 1 January 2009 and instruct the Clerk to advise the General Treasurer accordingly.

See Appendix 4 for Report

13 REPORT OF THE CLERK

The Clerk gave in his report

It was moved, seconded and agreed:

The Presbytery

elected the Rev Sunwoo Hwang, Korean Church as a corresponding member for the duration of his appointment as Senior Pastor, Edinburgh Korean Church.

14 ADJOURNMENT

The Presbytery, having appointed to meet at Queensferry Church at 6.45pm on Thursday 26th March 2009 for the Induction of Rev David C Cameron, adjourned to meet for ordinary business until Tuesday 14 April 2009 at 6.45pm in Palmerston Place Church.

Closed with prayer

Moderator

Clerk

Appendix 1

DISCUSSION PAPER

The discussion time is part of our exploration of what it means to be the Church in a post-Christian society. It will feed into the "reviewing our reviewing process" which will, later in the year, lead to a major overhaul of how Presbytery works with congregations. To help us tackle the subject here is an approach developed by our fellow Presbyterians in Canada.

* * *

We have come to the conclusion that, more than investigating the forms and practices of congregations and listing the outward things that congregations do to measure viability, there is an often overlooked need to discern and evaluate the underlying principles, values, and emotional motivations for a congregation's activities. Numbers and money often become the measure of a congregation's viability by default.

Through Christ, the Living Word, and empowered by the Spirit, Christians are called to enter into communities which embody God's grace and plan of salvation. We believe such gatherings (or congregations) have five fundamental purposes: worship, discipleship, evangelism, fellowship, and service. We believe that congregations will be viable when all five fundamental purposes are present and held in balance. We believe that a viable congregation is a healthy congregation. We also recognise that viability requires congregations to live and to develop in a certain cultural and demographic environment, and to adapt as that environment changes through the cyclical nature of life.

The Body of Christ

The scriptural image of the church that we find most fruitful in this discussion is "the body of Christ." (1 Corinthians 12; Colossians 1:18-20), with Christ as the Head. The image is more useful to describe a congregation than, "the family", whose definition changes over time. The body image emphasises: the diversity of members and gifts within the church; that all the members and gifts are equally necessary for the healthy functioning of the body; and that it is important to honour the quieter members and less obvious gifts. At the same time as the congregation is itself the body of Christ, it is also a member of a series of larger bodies within the Presbyterian polity: the Presbytery and General Assembly, and of the church universal.

Worship is "the shared experience of encountering God". Worship is the corporate expression of our need for God, the acknowledgment of God's worth and our dependence upon God, and the act of expressing our gratitude for all that God has done for us.

Discipleship is the act of following Christ. The church is called, in Matthew 28:18-20, to "go and make disciples. Discipleship is the act of discovering "and being devoted to the apostle's teachings" (Acts 2:42a) The church should equip its members with "practical guidance for expressing one's faith in the world during the week."

Fellowship is the opportunity of experiencing God's grace and love in and through God's people; the opportunity to become a part of a community of faith.

Service is demonstrating God's love in humility to others by meeting their needs and healing their hurts in the name of Jesus. As Christians, we are called to bring all of creation into reconciliation with the Creator as we seek to live fully in the body of Christ, serving God's interests, not our own. Jesus called us to be servants of all.

Evangelism is the calling of every Christian to be a witness to the gospel of Jesus Christ, bearing personal testimony to all whom they encounter.

All of these purposes overlap and reinforce one another in practice. A healthy congregation holds all of these purposes in balance. Maintaining balance requires faithful leadership and the wise stewardship of the congregation's resources. Overemphasis on any one purpose, leading to under-emphasis on others, produces distortion in the body of Christ.

Congregational Health

We were encouraged to view the health of the body or congregation as a useful metaphor.

A healthy congregation can

- celebrate the presence and working of the Spirit among its members
- understand and fulfill God's plan for them
- resist (and discern) evil
- help people come to faith and mature in faith
- deal constructively with a changing environment
- have an accurate picture of their identity and place this identity before God to be used as God wills
- be more than a group of people who worship together

Environment

A healthy body is able to function within and adapt to a changing environment. There is a fine line here between realism, and fatalism or complacency. The point is that size, growth, or even decline are not determinative of the health of the congregation. Congregations of any size may be healthy or unhealthy. Growth may or may not be healthy and sustainable.

* * *

In our discussion groups we will be looking at two questions. The first one is common to all the groups and asks:

"How would you describe a healthy congregation?"

After this the group will tackle the concept of health as it might be seen in one of the church's purposes: In your situation what would constitute health in worship, service, fellowship, discipleship or evangelism? You will be allocated to a group on arrival at Presbytery.

If we have a better understanding of the signs of good health in a congregation we will be able to move on in the coming months to exploring how, as a Presbytery, we identify these signs and encourage the well-being of the Body of Christ.

Appendix 2

Basis of Linking: Kaimes Lockhart Memorial with Liberton

a) **Transference of Property and Funds:** The property and funds belonging to or held on behalf of each congregation shall remain the property and funds of each congregation as at present.

b) **Places of Worship:** Both churches at present used and occupied by the congregations shall be the places of worship of the linked congregations. Services shall be conducted at times to be decided by the minister and the Kirk Sessions, subject to the approval of the Presbytery.

c) **Territorial Responsibility:** The bounds to be served by the linked charge shall be as currently served by the two parishes or as the Presbytery shall determine.

d) **Kirk Session:** The Minister of the linked charge shall be the Moderator of each Kirk Session. The two Kirk Sessions may meet together, as they deem it desirable.

e) **Congregational Management:** The temporal affairs of each congregation shall be administered as at present. The office-bearers of the two congregations shall meet annually to decide on their portion of the contribution to listed expenses and maintenance of the manse, as may be agreed from time to time by the office-bearers and subject to the approval of the Presbytery.

f) **Minister:**

The Reverend Dr John Young, the present minister of Liberton, shall be the first minister of the linked charge.

A full-time associate minister shall be appointed and shall carry out such duties in the linked charge as may be agreed with Dr Young and the two Kirk Sessions.

g) **Manse:**

The manse of Liberton shall be the manse of the linked congregations.

The manse of Kaimes Lockhart Memorial shall be made available for the use of the Associate Minister, sold, let or otherwise disposed of subject to the approval of the Presbytery and, if necessary, of the General Trustees or the General Assembly. The free proceeds of any such sale or let shall (a) if falling within the scope of Act VII 1995, be credited to the benefit of the congregation in the Consolidated Fabric Fund or (b) if not falling within the scope of the said Act, be held and applied for fabric purposes in connection with the properties of the linked congregations.

h) **Review:** The Presbytery shall review the linking five years after the linking has been effected, at which time it shall consider the extent to which progress has been made in the following areas: of work:
 Congregational Life – caring for existing congregation and developing patterns of worship accessible to local community;

Leadership – identifying, nurturing and developing local leadership, and sharing of expertise within Parish Grouping;

Parish Grouping – sharing in development of common vision and strategy for mission;

Mission and Outreach – working in partnership with others in areas such as youth work, family support, debt counselling etc.

i) Power to Readjust: While these articles and terms shall form the Basis of Linking for the two congregations now linking, the linked congregations shall be free like other congregations to adjust arrangements under the authority of Presbytery as need may arise.

Appendix 3

GENERAL ASSEMBLY 2008 REMIT – CONGREGATIONAL CONFLICT

Having considered the Ministries Council report on Congregational Conflict as contained in the Remits Booklet from the 2008 Assembly, the Superintendence Committee welcome the report and can identify with much of the report's contents. The churches in Edinburgh Presbytery where conflict is or has been an issue are thankfully small in number. However, actions have been taken whenever and however such situations have been brought to the attention of Superintendence. Some Superintendence interventions have been handled with discretion and confidentiality; other situations have been brought to the floor of Presbytery when the Committee decided Presbytery's consideration and endorsement of proposed actions was required.

Edinburgh Presbytery's Superintendence scheme, where it is followed correctly, is helpful in identifying current or potential situations of conflict through its partnership pairing of churches over a five year period. The scheme was implemented in recognition that a once-in-five-year Superintendence visit as required by Church law is unlikely to build relationships of trust and certainly does not identify conflict situations as they may develop.

Under the heading of 'Reviewing the Reviewing,' Presbytery recently agreed the following Deliverance: The Business Committee invite Presbytery to instruct the Conveners of Superintendence, Deployment of Resources, Mission and Discipleship, and Ministries to meet and bring forward proposals on how we might develop a single review process. That Deliverance, when worked out, will strengthen all aspects of Presbytery's oversight and support of ministries and congregations. Superintendence will be suggesting that one of the aims of these discussions should be to improve ways of ensuring that Presbytery maintains regular and meaningful contact with each congregation: the early identification of potential conflict situations would be only one of the benefits of regular and meaningful contact.

The Ministries Council report asks Presbytery to address the following: “to study the report and, in the light of the report, urgently review their practices to determine where these need immediate adjustment in order to (a) avoid destructive conflict and (b) deal more effectively with and resolve conflict situations when and where these arise, and report on any such adjustments to the Ministries Council by 31 March 2009.

Having considered current Presbytery practices, Superintendence is not aware of any specifics that require adjustment to avoid destructive conflict. That is not to say that Superintendence considers all Presbytery practices to be perfect. For instance, the workings of Committees and their interaction with ‘121’ too often result in unconscionable delays in decisions or recommendations when observed from the perspective of the average church member. Decisions should never be taken precipitately but delays that result in anxiety may lead to conflict and happen more often than is helpful.

Therefore, along with the current Review of Reviewing, Superintendence will be suggesting that consideration be given to some sort of ‘fast-track’ ways of working common in many organisations. Given the will, ways could be found of fast-tracking Presbytery and ‘121’ decisions thereby reducing uncertainty, stress and potential conflict for many.

Whilst Superintendence has no specific recommendations to make that would improve Presbytery’s current ways dealing with conflicted situations, it accepts unreservedly that there is always room for improvement and would welcome constructive comments and suggestions.

The sections of the report on Congregational Conflict that are particularly welcomed and deserve further reading are:

- § 5.3 – The Real Depth of Damage suggesting that conflict may sometimes be endemic to congregational life and how some individuals repeat the same conflicted behaviour in place after place.
- § 5.5.3.1 – The Expectation Gap there can be between a congregation’s expectations of a minister and a minister’s expectations of a congregation.
- § 5.5.5 – Organisational Change and how some people consider that churches should never change; problems with the management of change.
- § 5.5.6 – Personality Clashes that may be particularly acute in the early days of a new ministry.
- § 5.7.2 – Education and Training for those in team working situations within a voluntary environment.
- § 5.8 – Vacancies, Parish Profiles, Interim Moderators and Presbytery Advisers, Superintendence, Complaints and Disciplinary Procedures, Pastoral Intervention and Open and Transparent Processes.

Appendix 4

Conversations with Stewardship and Finance Committee – Update: Representatives of the Congregational Finance Committee and representatives of the Stewardship and Finance Committee had an initial meeting in December 08 to discuss concerns regarding the present Ministries and Mission contributions Scheme, which had been expressed by several of the congregations in the Edinburgh Presbytery.

From our initial discussions it would appear that the present Variable Scale Scheme (Ministries & Mission Contributions) which was set by the merger of the previous graduated Mission & Renewal Fund and National Stipend, although not ideal, is better than that previous scheme. The main reason being that increases are much flatter than would have been seen under the Mission & Renewal Fund & National Stipend Scheme where scales were increased on a regular basis with high percentages of residual income (after ministerial costs) being asked from congregations with high incomes. The present Marginal Rate ranges from 45-59%.

On examination of the 2009 Ministry and Mission Contributions for the congregations in the Edinburgh Presbytery the following percentages of income required to meet their Contributions are:-

32 Congregations use over 58% of their income.

37 Congregations use 55% of their income.

14 Congregations use less than 55% of their income

If the present scale was completely flat all congregations would be asked for 55.4% of their annual income. This would result in the lowest income congregations being asked to contribute a higher amount than presently being requested with the likely outcome being that they would be unable to meet that obligation.

Since the present scheme /scale was set up in 2006 there has always been the intention to that congregation's contributions should be as close to the scale figure as possible. However there are instances where a congregation's contribution is well below the scale figure. e.g. A congregation may have previously had an allowance for a Team Ministry or some special historical reason. We have identified 23 congregations below scale, 9 of which previously had an allowance for a Team Ministry. There are some congregations where it is unlikely that the scale figure will be reached in the near future or indeed ever. With increases being capped at a maximum of 9% and exacerbated by the Congregational Finance Committee restricting any rise in 2006 and 2007 to no more than 6% , some congregations are also taking longer than others to reach the scale figure. The Congregational Finance Committee will be reviewing all those congregations that are below the scale figure.

Out of the 83 congregations in the Edinburgh Presbytery 50 have sufficient income to meet their ministerial costs i.e. £39,100.

We intend having further discussions with Stewardship and Finance regarding future Ministries and Mission Contributions as we have several ideas to put forward and will report to Presbytery at a future meeting the outcome of these discussions. However in the meantime it should be noted that every congregation should have received a letter from Stewardship and Finance indicating where their particular congregation's Ministries and Mission Contribution is distributed.